Comparing Discipline
National Comparisons of Charter and Traditional Public Schools

December 7, 2016
Competing Narratives on Charters

1. Serve Disadvantaged  
2. Mission Driven  
3. Innovative

1. Cream skimmers  
2. Privatizers  
3. Punitive
Charter Schools, Civil Rights and School Discipline
A Comprehensive Review
Figure 2. Comparison of Charter and Non-Charter Suspension Rates in Schools:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Charters</th>
<th>Non-Charters</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>All K-12</td>
<td>7.8</td>
<td>6.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SWD</td>
<td>15.5</td>
<td>13.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SWOD</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5.7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Figure 2. Comparison of Charter and Non-Charter Suspension Rates in

Table 5a. Secondary Suspension Rates (zero-suspending omitted)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>OSS Rates</th>
<th>ALL</th>
<th>AME</th>
<th>H/PI</th>
<th>Asian</th>
<th>Black</th>
<th>Latino</th>
<th>White</th>
<th>EL</th>
<th>SWD</th>
<th>N</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Charter</td>
<td>13.2</td>
<td>13.1</td>
<td>6.8</td>
<td>3.7</td>
<td>24.2</td>
<td>10.4</td>
<td>6.6</td>
<td>11.2</td>
<td>23.3</td>
<td>1,425/1,765</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>82.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-Charter</td>
<td>10.5</td>
<td>16.1</td>
<td>8.7</td>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>23.6</td>
<td>11.2</td>
<td>7.1</td>
<td>11.9</td>
<td>20.8</td>
<td>28,706/31,434</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>91.3%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 5b. Secondary Suspension Rates, Including All Schools Reporting Zero Suspensions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>OSS Rates</th>
<th>ALL</th>
<th>AME</th>
<th>H/PI</th>
<th>Asian</th>
<th>Black</th>
<th>Latino</th>
<th>White</th>
<th>EL</th>
<th>SWD</th>
<th>N</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Charter</td>
<td>11.6</td>
<td>10.9</td>
<td>5.4</td>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>9.1</td>
<td>5.6</td>
<td>9.9</td>
<td>20.8</td>
<td>1,765</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-Charter</td>
<td>10.2</td>
<td>15.4</td>
<td>8.5</td>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>22.9</td>
<td>10.8</td>
<td>6.8</td>
<td>11.5</td>
<td>20.1</td>
<td>31,434</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: The graphic depiction of charter school rates in Figure 1 uses the data from table above with zeros.
**Charter Schools Suspend Black and Disabled Students More, Study Says**

By MOTOKO RICH  MARCH 16, 2016

Black students are four times as likely to be suspended from charter schools as white students, according to a new analysis of federal education data. And students with disabilities, the study found, are suspended two to three times the rate of nondisabled students in charter schools.

These inequities are similar to those in traditional public schools, where black and disabled students are disproportionately disciplined for even minor infractions, and as early as preschool — although on average, charter schools suspend pupils at slightly higher rates than traditional public schools.

The analysis of charter school data from the Department of Education’s Office for Civil Rights of close to 5,000 charters was done by the Center for Civil Rights Remedies at the University of California, Los Angeles, a nonprofit civil rights research and policy organization.
Compared to what?
Identify neighboring traditional public schools

**Match Charters:**
- To the nearest 5 traditional public schools (TPS)
- Serving the same grade ranges
- In the same jurisdiction.

Compare Charters to all TPSs, **and to their neighboring TPSs**.
Free and Reduced-Price Meals

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Percentage</th>
<th>Traditional Public Schools</th>
<th>Charter Schools</th>
<th>Neighboring Traditional Public Schools</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1-34%</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35-49%</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>50-74%</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>75%+</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Compared how?
Charter vs. Neighboring TPS
Distribution of differences
Free and Reduced Priced Meals

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Substantially Less</th>
<th>Somewhat Less</th>
<th>Similar</th>
<th>Somewhat More</th>
<th>Substantially More</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Charter Schools</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reference Traditional</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public Schools</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Chart vs. Neighboring TPS

Distribution of differences
Suspension Rates

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Substantially Less</th>
<th>Somewhat Less</th>
<th>Similar</th>
<th>Somewhat More</th>
<th>Substantially More</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Charter Schools</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reference Traditional</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>79</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public Schools</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
In School Suspension by State

Unlike their Neighbors. Malkus. 2016, AEI
Out-of-School Suspension by State

Unlike their Neighbors. Malkus. 2016, AEI
Discipline by Charter Academic Model

-Models coded by NAPCS & AEI

- General (2019)
- No Excuses (259)
- STEM (230)
- ARTS (142)
- Classical (87)
- Purposefully Diverse (17)
- Single Sex (30)

- International (180)
- Progressive (349)
- Credit Recovery (146)
- Public Policy (10)
- Vocational (53)
- Military (13)

Source: Civil Rights Data Collection, NAPCS. See McShane & Hatfield, Measuring Diversity in Charter School Offerings, AEI
Suspension by Charter Academic Model (no zeros)

Unpublished data from the Civil Rights Data Collection.
Suspension by Charter Academic Model (zeros)

- General
- Credit Recovery
- Vocational
- ARTS
- Single Sex
- No Excuses
- STEM
- Public Policy
- International
- Purposefully Diverse
- Progressive
- Classical
- Military

Unpublished data from the Civil Rights Data Collection.
Takeaways

Which Narrative is Right? Neither

Context, Context, Context.

Which TPSs Charters are compared to matters.

How you compare them matters.

Discipline is a challenge for schools of all types...

...deal with it in appropriate context.
Takeaways

Which Narrative is Right?  Neither
Context, Context, Context.

Which TPSs Charters are compared to matters,
How you compare them matters.

Discipline is a challenge for schools of all types…
…deal with it in appropriate context.
Takeaways

Which Narrative is Right?  Neither
Context, Context, Context.
  Which TPSs Charters are compared to matters.
  How you compare them matters.
Discipline is a challenge for schools of all types…
  …deal with it in appropriate context.
Takeaways

Which Narrative is Right?  Neither
Context, Context, Context.
  Which TPSs Charters are compared to matters.
  How you compare them matters.
Discipline is a challenge for schools of all types…
…deal with it in appropriate context.
Thank You

Nat Malkus
American Enterprise Institute