HOW CHOICE-FRIENDLY ARE AMERICAN CITIES?

To answer this question for Tulsa and the twenty-nine other cities in this study, we combined publicly available data from federal, state, and local governments with proprietary data from a variety of education groups and a questionnaire of local stakeholders. We assigned cities scores from zero to four on multiple measures of choice friendliness, which we grouped into three areas: political support, policy environment, and quantity and quality. Cities received an aggregate score for each area as well as an overall score, which we obtained using a weighted average that estimates each area’s contribution to a city’s overall choice friendliness (more below).

For the purposes of this study, we defined “choice” as any alternative to the traditional neighborhood school, including charter, magnet, career and technical education, private or religious, and online or virtual schools, as well as homeschooling or other choice mechanisms, such as vouchers and open or dual enrollment programs.

Area I: Political Support (15%)
This area assesses the willingness of local officials and other stakeholders to use their political capital to support school choice, as well as the degree to which the local media support choice in the community.

Area II: Policy Environment (35%)
This area evaluates the policies and practices that ease the challenges that providers and consumers of school choice face. Support for providers includes funding, facilities, and technical assistance, and support for consumers includes information about school performance and school choice writ large, as well as making the act of choosing easier via a common application for all schools.

Area III: Quantity & Quality (50%)
This area quantifies the school choice options that are available to families (e.g., charter, magnet, and online), as well as the accessibility and quality of those options.

HOW CHOICE-FRIENDLY IS TULSA?

Thanks to a historically contentious relationship with the local school board, Tulsa’s charter sector is still small. However, recent developments suggest that change may be on its way. In 2015, Tulsa Public Schools announced a plan to partner with charter incubator Building Excellent Schools to open three “in-district” charters, and the plan’s prospects were boosted by the passage of HB 1691, which legalized the proposed arrangement. The bill was only the most recent victory for school choice advocates, who were already celebrating the passage of SB 782, which expanded the right to authorize charters to every district in the state, while also granting the State Board of Education the authority to close low-performing charter schools.
Area I: Political Support

**15 POINTS**

**TULSA RANKS TWENTY-THIRD** out of thirty cities on political support, with a score of seven points out of fifteen. This low ranking reflects a number of factors, including lukewarm support for school choice among local officials and a mix of support and opposition within the broader Tulsa community. Although the superintendent and parent groups have supported school choice, the mayor and city council have remained relatively neutral, while the teachers’ union has been unsupportive. Tulsa’s leading newspaper has also adopted a negative tone in its coverage of school choice.

Area II: Policy Environment

**35 POINTS**

**TULSA RANKS ELEVENTH** out of thirty cities on policy environment, with a score of twenty-four points out of thirty-five. The city receives high marks for philanthropic and business support and the number of charter schools located in district facilities. It also benefits from Oklahoma's flexible teacher policies, which exempt charter schools from collective bargaining and teacher certification requirements. However, the lack of a common application for schools of choice makes it difficult for families to navigate the system, and the district (which authorizes about half of the city’s charters) does not engage in many of the practices associated with quality authorizing, according to the National Association of Charter School Authorizers.

Area III: Quantity & Quality

**50 POINTS**

**TULSA RANKS TWENTY-EIGHTH** out of thirty cities on quantity and quality, with a score of twenty-seven points out of fifty. The city offers a variety of options to families, including charter, magnet, career and technical education, independent, Catholic, and virtual schools, as well as homeschooling. Most Tulsa students are eligible for Oklahoma’s tax credit scholarship program; however, because funding for the program is capped at just $5 million, the number of students it serves is small. Similarly, although there are some interdistrict and dual enrollment programs, the lack of intradistrict open enrollment limits the options available to families. Finally, compared to the other cities in our study, Tulsa has few public schools of choice, and a very low percentage of students enroll in charter schools.

---

TULSA RANKS TWENTY-FOURTH OUT OF THIRTY CITIES OVERALL, with its low scores for political support and the quantity of choice outweighing its higher marks for choice-friendly policies and practices. Recent developments suggest that both Tulsa and Oklahoma are becoming more choice-friendly, but it remains to be seen if the current momentum will translate into a larger and more dynamic array of options going forward.
### Tulsa Results

**How Choice-Friendly is Tulsa?**

#### Area I: Political Support (15%)

1. **Official Support**
   - 1.1.A To what extent do you agree/disagree that the mayor is willing to use his/her political capital to support school choice? (Neutral 2.00)
   - 1.1.B To what extent do you agree/disagree that the city council is willing to use its political capital to support school choice? (Neutral 2.00)
   - 1.1.C To what extent do you agree/disagree that the superintendent is willing to use his/her political capital to support school choice? (Agree 3.00)
   - 1.1.D To what extent do you agree/disagree that the school board is willing to use its political capital to support school choice? (Agree 3.00)
   - 1.1.E Has the governor mentioned school choice in his/her “state of the state” speeches? (No 0.00)

2. **Community Support**
   - 1.2.A To what extent do you agree/disagree that the teachers’ unions are willing to use their political capital to support school choice? (Strongly disagree/Disagree 0.67)
   - 1.2.B To what extent do you agree/disagree that parent groups are willing to use their political capital to support school choice? (Neutral/Agree 2.67)
   - 1.2.C To what extent do you agree/disagree that the media are willing to use their political capital to support school choice? (Agree 3.00)
   - 1.2.D What is the overall tone toward school choice as reflected in the editorials, op-eds, and opinion pieces of Tulsa’s principal newspaper? (Very negative 0.00)

#### Area II: Policy Environment (35%)

2.1 **Public Policies**
   - 2.1.A To what extent does Oklahoma charter law restrict the number of charter schools in the state? (The state has a cap with some room for growth 2.00)
   - 2.1.B Are multiple authorizers available to prospective charter school operators in Tulsa? (Yes 4.00)
   - 2.1.C Is Tulsa’s largest school district a member of the Portfolio School District Network? (Yes 4.00)

2.2 **Public Facilities**
   - 2.2.A Does Oklahoma have a “right of first refusal” policy for charter schools to obtain facilities? (No 0.00)
   - 2.2.B What percentage of Tulsa charter schools are located or co-located in city- or district-owned buildings? (More than 50% 4.00)

2.3 **Public Support**
   - 2.3.A In how many ways do public entities support schools of choice in Tulsa (of 9 possible)? (5 (of 9 possible) 2.30)
   - 2.3.B How great is the disparity between district and charter per-pupil funding in Tulsa? (** **)
   - 2.3.C Does Tulsa law guarantee adequate funding for charter authorizers? (Yes 4.00)

2.4 **NGO Support**
   - 2.4.A Is there a state NGO that supports school choice in Tulsa? (Yes* 2.00)
   - 2.4.B In how many ways do NGOs in Tulsa support schools of choice (of 9 possible)? (6 (of 9 possible) 2.59)

2.5 **Business Support**
   - 2.5.A Is there business-community support in Tulsa for schools of choice? (Yes, for most/all types of schools of choice 3.67)
   - 2.5.B In how many ways does the business community in Tulsa support schools of choice (of 9 possible)? (7 (of 9 possible) 3.04)

2.6 **Philanthropic Support**
   - 2.6.A Is there philanthropic support in Tulsa for schools of choice? (Yes, for most/all types of schools of choice 3.67)
   - 2.6.B In how many ways does the philanthropic community support schools of choice in Tulsa (of 9 possible)? (9 (of 9 possible) 4.00)
   - 2.6.C Of 5 major national foundations (Broad, Carnegie, Gates, Joyce, and Walton), how many support schools of choice in Tulsa? (1 (of 5) 1.00)

2.7 **Teacher Policies**
   - 2.7.A Are Tulsa charter schools exempt from local collective bargaining agreements? (Yes 4.00)
   - 2.7.B Are Tulsa charter schools required to hire certified teachers? (No 4.00)

2.8 **Quality Control**
   - 2.8.A Is there a regular review process by an oversight body with authority to sanction authorizers? (No 0.00)
   - 2.8.B What is the average quality score, out of 12, for Tulsa’s charter authorizers (e.g., do they use academic, financial, and operational performance data to make merit-based renewal decisions)? (4.00 0.00)
   - 2.8.C Does the district have a policy for closing schools due to low enrollment and a history of doing so? (** **)

**Area I Points (out of 36.00) = 16.34**

**Area I Score: 16.34/36.00 x 15% = 6.81**

**Area II continued on next page...**
CONSUMER ENVIRONMENT

### AREA III: QUANTITY & QUALITY (50%)

#### 3.1 Types of Schools

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>3.1.A</th>
<th>Are charter schools available to families in Tulsa?</th>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>4.00</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3.1.B</td>
<td>Are magnet and/or CTE schools available to families in Tulsa?</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>4.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1.C</td>
<td>Are independent schools available to families in Tulsa?</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>4.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1.D</td>
<td>Are Catholic schools available to families in Tulsa?</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>4.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1.E</td>
<td>Are online and/or virtual schools available to families in Tulsa?</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>4.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1.F</td>
<td>Is homeschooling available to families in Tulsa?</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>4.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### 3.2 Access

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>3.2.A</th>
<th>Does the district facilitate intradistrict open enrollment, either through attendance waivers or through a districtwide lottery?</th>
<th>No</th>
<th>0.00</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3.2.B</td>
<td>Are there interdistrict enrollment options in Tulsa? Can districts opt out?</td>
<td>Yes, but districts can opt out</td>
<td>3.50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.C</td>
<td>Are there dual enrollment options in Tulsa? Can districts opt out?</td>
<td>Yes; no opt out</td>
<td>2.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### 3.3 Market Share

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>3.3.A</th>
<th>Compared to other cities in the study, what percentage of public schools in Tulsa are schools of choice (charter, magnet, and/or CTE schools)?</th>
<th>Comparably, a very low percentage</th>
<th>0.00</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3.3.B</td>
<td>Compared to other cities in the study, what percentage of students in Tulsa enroll in charter schools?</td>
<td>Comparably, a low percentage</td>
<td>0.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### 3.4 Quality

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>3.4.A</th>
<th>What is the marginal impact of attending a Tulsa charter school on learning gains in reading?</th>
<th>**</th>
<th>**</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3.4.B</td>
<td>What is the marginal impact of attending a Tulsa charter school on learning gains in math?</td>
<td>**</td>
<td>**</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**AREA III POINTS (out of 32.00) = 17.50**

**AREA III SCORE: 17.50/32.00 x 50% = 27.34**

TOTAL SCORE: 6.81 + 23.79 + 27.34 = 57.94